



A Conversation with Fred Klarer (continued)

與弗雷德對話（續）

By Fred Klarer to Dharma Realm Buddhist University's Venerable Master Legacy Club on October 7, 2020

Chinese Translated by Janet Lee

弗雷德·克萊爾講於2020年10月7日法界佛教大學「宣公上人志業傳承社」

李采真 中譯

Fred Klarer (Dharma name, Gwo Hu, 果護) first met the Venerable Master Hsuan Hua at the age of twenty-one in the spring of 1969 at the Buddhist Lecture Hall on Waverly Place. Fred later went on to take refuge and also received the novice precepts at the conclusion of the Summer Session of 1969 where he received the monastic name Heng Shou (恒守), which he kept for his seven years as a monastic. Since then, Fred has gone on to receive a Bachelor of Arts in East Asian Languages and Literature from Harvard University and a Juris Doctor from Harvard Law School. Fred currently lives in Yaphank, New York and continues his Dharma practice.

1969年春天，21歲的弗雷德(果護) 在天后廟街的佛教講堂第一次見到了宣公上人。弗雷德後來在1969年夏法會結束受了皈依和沙彌戒，法號恒守，他作了七年比丘。那以後，弗雷德繼續獲得哈佛大學東亞語言文學學士學位和哈佛法學院法學博士學位。弗雷德目前居住在紐約州亞潘克市，並繼續他的佛法修行。

Q: What were some of the expectations Shifu had of his monastic disciples, and how did he teach them?

A: He taught everybody the same way. As I said before, he interacted with you individually, but in the group lectures, at Dharma lectures, and community talks and the like, he would be more general. But for monastics, first of all, you have to understand that you are living off of other people, that every grain of rice you eat, and every piece of paper that you use, and every item of clothing you wear, somebody worked for, they came from some person's effort. And you had better be very clear about that, you don't deserve anything, that you have to earn it.

That's why, frankly, I went to work for a year. Because I didn't want to start with a debt. And I'm glad I did. Although it took me away from the daily efforts in the community, I

問：有人想問，師父對他的出家弟子有什麼期望，他是如何教導他們的？

答：他以同樣的方式教導每個人。正如我之前所說，他會對你個別施教，但在小型講座、在講經說法的課堂和大眾場合中，他會說得比較概括性。但是他對僧眾說，首先，你要知道，你是靠施主的供養，你吃的每一粒米，你用的每一張紙，你穿的每一件衣服，都是別人工作換來的，這些供養來自他人的努力；你最好要非常清楚這一點，你憑什麼接受供養，因此你必須努力，才對得起這些供養。

坦白說，這就是為什麼我出家前先去工作了一年，因為我不想一開始就欠債。事實上，我很高興我這麼做了。雖

felt that when I became a monk, I at least would have paid something into the account. I think that was Shifu's first expectation. He didn't expect you to be some great master or anything. But first of all, you maintain the precepts as purely as possible. And you recognize with gratitude, the opportunity that you have, that other people are paying for it, other people are working and contributing. So you can sit on that meditation stool, or you can translate that sutra, but Shifu's first expectation was that you recognized what others were doing for you and that you owed it to them to do a good job. That's what I would say.

Q: Do you have any suggestion for how Buddhism can prosper in the West? What should we do differently from what we are doing now?

A: Well, I don't know what you're doing now, so I can't answer from that perspective. But I think the most important thing is to practice genuinely, to be a really serious practitioner, and to recognize that doing that is the single most important thing you can do. It's very easy to externalize your desire while we've got to print books, have lectures, or have meditation sessions. Yes, these are all very, very important, but there are a lot of people who have turned Buddhism into a business. I don't think we should do that. Personally I'm not very impressed with that. But you know, that's my own perspective.

I'm not qualified to do say that, because it's too likely I'll make a mistake and say something that will mislead people. I think that you have to recognize what you know and what you don't know, as Confucius said. And the best thing to do is stick with what Shifu taught. He left these vast resources. I also very highly recommend listening to the original lectures. You know, people often don't recognize that he's transmitting these Dharmas. He used to start simply giving a Dharma lecture. When he reads the sutra, you're receiving a transmission of that text from an awakened person. I mean in some ways the lectures are kind of boring, because you've heard all the stories after a while and he's saying very basic things. But first of all, he's transmitting these Dharma thought. They are living. A sutra is something that's alive.

然這讓我那年失去在道場服務的機會，但我覺得當我成為一名僧侶之前，我至少能夠支付了一些費用。我認為這是他的第一個期望。師父並沒有期待你會成為一個偉大的高僧之類的。但首先，你要盡可能地持戒清淨。你要對自己所擁有的，心懷感激，因為這是他人打工的付出所成就的。你可以在禪凳上打坐，你也可以翻譯經典，但師父的第一個期望是，你要認識到別人為你做了什麼，你應該做好自己的本份。這就是我要說的。

問：您對使佛教在西方世界興盛有什麼建議嗎？我們應該做些什麼有別於我們現在正在做的事情？

答：嗯，我不知道你們現在正在做什麼，所以我無法從這個角度回答。但我認為最重要的是實打實去修行，做一個真正認真的修行人，並認識到這樣做是你所能做的最重要的事。而且在我們必須出版書、進行講座或者有打坐課程時，它很容易將你的欲望外化。是的，這些都是非常非常重要的，但也有很多人已經把佛教變成了一門生意。我認為我們不應該那樣做；我個人對此觀感不佳。但你知道，這只是我個人的觀點。

我不夠資格給出建議，因為我很可能會犯錯並說出誤導他人的話。我認為，修行人必須認識到你知什麼和你不知什麼，正如孔子所說：「知之為知之，不知為不知」。最好的辦法是遵循師父的教導；他留給我們的這些龐大資源（法寶）。我也非常強烈推薦聽師父的原音講座。你們知道，師父開始只是簡單在講佛法，而人們往往沒有意識他正在傳佈這些佛法。當師父念這段經文時，你正是從一個證悟者那裡接收到那段經文。我的意思是，師父的講座或許有點無聊，因為你已經聽了一段時間也聽過所有的故事，而且說的都是非常基礎的道理。但首要的是，他正在傳遞這些佛法思維（心法）——它們是活的，佛經是活的。

師父是透過他自己的體現把它傳遞給我

And he's transmitting it to us through his own embodiment of it, and so to hear it is invaluable. If you can't hear him in person, you can listen to the tapes, for they're just as good. He is behind them all, so to accept and listen to it is just what Manjushri says in the *Shurangama Sutra* about hearing the sound is the best method for teaching in our Saha world. Then Avalokitesvara continues the teaching on, following sound back to its source. Even if you don't know Chinese, you should still listen to those lectures, honestly, because it's just this river of living Dharma that washes through you, and it's fantastic.

Q: How do you spread the Dharma?

A: The Dharma doesn't need to be spread. The Dharma is available to anyone who's interested. But you need to be a person who is able to pass it along. Again, I am not a Dharma teacher, so don't misunderstand me. I'm simply speaking from my own experience. If I'm wrong, I apologize. If I say something that you think is wrong, you should definitely pay no attention to it.

On the other hand, I've been deeply involved with Dharma since I was a kid and I still am. I take it very seriously. I really think the key is always bodhichitta. First, if your motivations are not pure, it doesn't matter what you do, you're not going to do it right. You start with bodhichitta, which is about becoming a fully awakened Buddha, and the nature of the Buddha mind is compassion and action. But you have to understand how much of that you really understand, and what you can do. I've seen so many people in this modern Buddhist world who begin to think they know better. They think, "I know better, we're going to change this or we're going to change that." Yes, there are things that maybe do need to be changed, but unless you're the person who knows exactly what to do, it's too easy to make a mistake. I'm very conservative about this sort of thing. There are people or some Buddhist groups who are very popular and well known, and yet in my experience they have drifted away from the core, the core teachings. You can't do it that way, if that makes any sense again.

們，所以能聽到師父講法是無價寶的。如果不能親自聽到他的聲音，你可以聽錄音，效果也一樣好。因為師父正在其後，所以接受和傾聽就是文殊師利菩薩在《楞嚴經》中所說的，在我們的娑婆世界中，聽聞音聲是最好的修習教法；然後觀世音菩薩繼續教導我們，跟隨音聲返照到它的本源（返聞聞自性）。即使你不懂中文，你仍然應該聆聽他那些講座，老實說，因為正是這條從心性法中流出的河在洗透你，這真是太棒了。

問：您如何傳佈佛法？

答：佛法不需要傳佈。佛法是歡迎任何感興趣的人使用。但是你需要成為一個能夠傳遞它的人；再重申一次，我不是一個佛法老師，請不要誤解，我只是從我個人的經驗來講。如果錯了，我道歉。如果我說了一些你認為錯誤的話，你就徹底忽略它。

另一方面，我從小就與佛法結下不解之緣，現在依然如此，非常認真以對。我確實覺得，關鍵永遠是菩提心（梵語bodhichitta）。首先，如果你的動機不純正，無論你做什麼，你都不會往對的做。一切始於菩提心，菩提心是關於成為一個完全覺悟的佛，而佛本初心（佛性）就是慈悲和實行（修行）。但你必須清楚你自己真正了解多少，以及你自己能做什麼。我見到過很多人，在這個現代佛教界裡，他們都開始認為自己懂很多；他們認為，「我知道得很清楚了，我們要改變這個，或者我們要改變那個。」是的，有些事可能確實需要改變，但除非你確切清楚知道該如何做，否則很容易犯錯。

我對這些事情一向持保守態度。有些人或一些佛教團體非常受歡迎也很知名，然而，根據我的經驗，他們早已離經叛道，偏離了佛教教義。你們不能像那樣——我的意思是，如果這又有任何意義的話。我只是給我自己的看法。佛法是我每天生活的絕對重心，而且我在修持和學習的涉獵是非常廣泛，但事實上，我幾乎什麼都不懂，這有點令人費解，但還要竭盡所能繼續向前。

I'm just giving you my own take on this. Dharma is the absolute center of my life all day long every day. I practice and study very extensively. The fact that I've understood virtually nothing is a bit puzzling, but you do what you can to go on.

Q: Would you like to share some of your meditation experiences?

A: There is no point in sharing this, really. People have experiences in meditation. They're many different kinds of experiences in meditation, some of them are the results of past causes coming to fruition. Others are from connection to other beings who can help you. Time and space can be modified. I would sit for three or four hours, and it seemed like about twenty minutes to me. It was also really funny, as it would get light, the birds would all start chirping, and after a while I could understand them—that was the kind of interesting experience. They were just like people talking about what is for breakfast.

I don't know. I'm reluctant to talk about that sort of stuff for a couple of reasons. One is that these are not the essential issues in practice. Many times contemplative experiences are simply causes coming into fruition in your current state. What's much more important is how you react to them. There is the chapter on the "Fifty Demon States" where it said very, very clearly that you can have all kinds of experiences as the skandhas disintegrate, or various things happen with the elements.

What's far more important is that you are not moved by the experiences and that you recognize the essential nature of every single event. Physical, psychological, or whatever perfect and pure manifestation of the nature of reality happens, it doesn't matter. So to talk about specific experiences takes you away from what's really important, which is awakening. I mean, there's no secret that I've had a lot of interaction with various beings and have experienced all kinds of other states. But you know, it isn't important.

I don't know why Shifu would have me talk about this stuff, and he had me talk about everything. He had me talking about some things, but a lot of other things that were not public. And I don't really think it's appropriate to talk about those sorts of things. For one, I'm not an awakened master, and I have no way of judging the quality of this experience. I'm not qualified to tell other people about them and what they mean. And I think more

問：可以請您分享一些您的禪修經驗嗎？

答：分享這個是沒有意義的，真的。在禪修方面有經驗的人，他們的禪修體驗有許多不同境況，有些是過去的因所結的果，有些則是連結於來自其他能幫助你的力量。然而，時間和空間真的是可以被修改、變更。我會打坐三四個小時，對我來說，感覺就像只坐了20分鐘。這也非常有趣，因為它就像天剛透亮的時刻，鳥兒都開始啾啾叫，過了一會兒，我就能明白牠們了——那是一種有趣的經驗，牠們就像人們在談論早餐要吃什麼一樣的平常。

我不知道。出於幾個理由，我不願意談論這類事情。一是這些都不是修行中的重點問題。很多時候，禪修的體驗只是在你的現況中所呈現出的結果；更重要的是，你如何看待它們的呈現。在五十陰魔的境界中，它解析得非常透徹：隨著陰境的打破，你可以有各種的經歷，或者各種各樣的執境會隨著四大發生。

更重要的是，你不要被它所動，要認識每一個境相的妄源。生理的、心理的，或是任何完美而純粹的現象中本然的表現，都無關緊要。所以若要談論具體的經驗，我認為它會讓你遠離真正重要的事情，那就是開悟。我的意思是，我與各種形形色色的眾生有很多互動，也有過各種境界，這已經不是什麼秘密了。但你們要知道，這並不重要。

我不知道為什麼師父曾經讓我講這些事情，他讓我講所有的體驗。他讓我講一些境界，但還有很多其他沒有公開的。我真的不認為講這類境界是合適的。首先，我不是一個開悟者，我沒有辦法判斷這種境界的質量。我沒有資格告訴別人這些經驗以及境界的含義。而且我認為更重要的是，很容易讓人想要有這些境界的發生。

「我想見到佛，我想看到菩薩，我想

importantly that it's too easy to want those things to happen.

“I want to see a Buddha, I want to see a Bodhisattva, I want to see the absolute quiet and peace”— every one of these is a conditioned experience. And we're trying to get beyond that. Even if it's conditioned, you need to get to the core of it. Shifu used to have me talk about these experiences at the Buddhist Lecture Hall, and I was never very happy about doing it. But he told me to do it, so I did. And it would encourage people, but it's not that I'm special or something; it's just that's my experience. I think that's all I can really say.

Q: Could elaborate a little bit more on what bodhicitta means, and how do you know if you have it or not?

A: I'll let you know when I find out. I'm working on it. The word is a compound Sanskrit word, *bodhi* and *citta*. Bodhi comes from the Sanskrit root, which means “awareness,” “awake.” It meant “to wake up from sleep.” “*Citta*” means “mind.” *Bodhicitta* is an awakened mind, but that doesn't tell you a whole lot. What is bodhicitta? Bodhicitta is the essence of a Buddha. And that essence is the nature of reality, and part of the nature of reality is a function of compassion, of recognizing that that awakened state is the natural state of all beings. So anyone who is truly awakened naturally wants to help others awaken.

That's what bodhicitta is. It's an absolute commitment to that experience and that interaction with others. Now, I'm not an expert in this sort of thing. There are lots of books that you can read. But ultimately, you have to reflect on these sorts of things and see how it is within you. Shifu talked about this a lot. He talked about in the very phenomenal way: don't be selfish, don't be stupid, care for other people. I think it's a lifetime process. I mean, there's a Tibetan teaching from the Kanjur, called “Parting from the Four Attachments.” It's just four lines. The first line says, “If you're attached to this life, you're not a Dharma person.” It really means exactly what it says. If you think this life is so important, then you have not really entered into Dharma.

Then the second line says, “If you're attached to this world, you'll never escape it.” If you're attached, that's why these experiences of going to this heaven or this place are still a conditioned existence. We need to transcend that. So if you want to get born as a god or as a whatever, you're missing the point.

The third line is kind of hard to translate. “If you are focused

看看純粹的靜謐」——這些都是有為法。我們要試著超越這一點。即使是有為法，你也要到達它的核心。師父曾經讓我在佛教講堂談這些經歷，我從來都是不樂意這樣做；但他要我這樣做，我就照做。這能鼓勵大家，但這並不是說我很特別或怎麼樣。這僅僅是我的體驗。我想這就是我所能說的。

問：有人想要請問您，您是否能更詳細地闡述菩提心的含義，以及如何知道自己有沒有菩提心？

答：當我明白時，我會告訴你；我還在努力中。「Bodhicitta（菩提心）」是一個梵語單詞，是「bodhi（菩提）」和「chitta（心）」的組合。「Bodhi」來自梵文字根，意味著覺知、覺醒，意思是從睡夢中醒過來。「Chitta」的意思是心（mind，覺心）。「Bodhicitta（菩提心）」即是覺悟的心（awakened mind），但這並不能告訴你很多信息。什麼是菩提心？菩提心是佛陀的精髓。這個精髓就是實相的本體，而實相本體的一部分就是慈悲的作用，是認識到覺悟的狀態就是一切眾生的本然狀態（一切眾生皆有佛性）。因此，任何真正的證悟者，自然願意幫助他人證悟。

這就是菩提心。它是對那種體驗和與他人互動的全心投入。我不是這類的專家。是有很多書可以閱讀的。但最終，你必須反思這些事情，檢視自己的菩提心。師父經常說到這一點，他以非常特別的方式談，比方說不要自私，不要愚癡，關心別人。我認為這是一個終生的學習課題。藏文大藏經當中，有一種教義，叫做「遠離四種執著」。它只有四行。第一行說：「若執著此生，則非修行者。」它真正的意思是說：如果你認為今生如此重要，那麼你還沒有真正進入佛法。

然後第二行說，「若執著世間，則

on your own goals, you don't have bodhicitta." The Tibetan words, for bodhicitta is "pure mind." It's not that bodhi awakened mind is the pure mind. If you're focused on your own goals, you don't have the pure mind of a Buddha. Does that mean you can't have any goals? No, it doesn't. But it means that you're not selfishly focused on wanting to be an arhat, and instead you want to be a Bodhisattva.

The fourth line is that if you have a view, (if you're grasping at views), you don't have the view." It's the same thing with someone like Shifu; he didn't think about bodhicitta. That was probably the last thing he would ever think about, for he was bodhicitta. I'm just a guy who read a lot of books, tried to figure out, and tried to understand some of these things. I know Shifu used to tell me it was because I read a lot of commentaries. He said, "You're not going to learn anything in the commentaries; you have to internalize the text." He said, "In fact, you should write your own sutras." Does that mean that you run and write sutras? No, of course not. What he was saying was that every sutra is the expression from an awakened being into words of an experience. And so that's what we have to do.

This is my experience and I could be dead wrong. You could find someone else who thinks that I'm completely off base. But I think it comports with what Shifu taught, which is that you have to start with the mind of the Buddha, even if you can't really, even if you can only do one little grain of sand on the beach, it's still what you have to do. As you lose that selfishness and that orientation, the world opens up into this marvelous place. And the only real reaction to it is compassion: that I've woken up one tiny bit compared to the people around me and all the stupid things they're doing, yet I do most of them myself and only occasionally I don't. And all I can do is hope that they will wake up to that, and I'll do what I can to help them. That's what bodhicitta is; it's about action. It's not about some big idea. Again, this may be the ravings of a madman here, but this is what I think.

永遠不能出離。」如果你執著於此，那就是為什麼這些去到天界或到這個地方的經歷，仍然是有為的存在。但我們需要超越這些。因此，如果你想生而為神或其他什麼的，那你就放錯重點。

第三行有點難以翻譯。「執著己目的，不具菩提心。」在藏語中，菩提心（梵bodhicitta，藏byang chub sems）是「純淨心（pure mind）」。事實並非如此。這並不是說菩提覺醒的心即是純淨的心。如果你專注於利己的目標，你就沒有佛陀的純淨心。這是否意味著你不能有任何目標？不，它不是。但這意味著你並不是自私自利己專注於想要成為一個阿羅漢，相反地，你是想成為一個菩薩。

第四行是，「當執著生起，正見已喪失。」如果你執著見（見地），你就沒有見（正見）。即便像師父這樣的人也是如此，他並沒有想到菩提心；那可能是他最不會去想到的事，因為他就是菩提心。我只是讀過很多書，試圖弄清楚，並試圖理解其中的一些事情。我知道師父曾經告訴我，這是因為我讀了太多註釋。他說：「你不會在註釋中學到任何東西；你必須消化經文。」他說：「其實，你應該寫你自己的經。」這是否意味著你該跑去寫一部經？不，當然不是。他的意思是，每一部經都是證悟者從文字中表達一種體悟。這就是我們必須做的。

這是我的個人經歷，我可能大錯特錯了。你可以找到認為我是毫無根據的人。但我認為這與師父的教法相符，那就是你必須從佛心開始，即使你還不能真正做到，即使你只能在沙灘上做一粒微塵，這仍然是你必須做的。當你沒有了那種自私心和那種導向時，世界就會向你敞開，而轉向一個奇妙的境域。對此唯一真正的反應就是慈悲心：與我周圍的人以及他們正在做的所有愚癡的事情相比，我已經覺醒了一點點，但我自己也做了其中大部分，只是偶爾我不這樣做。我所能做的就是希望他們能醒覺過來，我會盡我所能幫助他們。這就是菩提心；這是關於實行的部分。這不是什麼了不起的想法。再重申一次，這可能只是一個瘋子在這裡胡說，但這就是我的想法。

Q: Do you think Buddhism has become mainstream in the West? Or do Americans still look at the Dharma as exotic?

A: I think it's pretty well widely accepted, not that there's a whole lot of followers, but it's recognized as a legitimate part of our culture. Mostly what people think of when they think of Buddhism is either the South Asian aspect like Buddhism from Thailand, Burma, or the Tibetans, but nobody is surprised that I'm a Buddhist or that my house has five thousand Buddha images in it.

A lot of people have Buddha images. In fact, Buddha images are very common in people's houses, you see them all over. There's a sense of peacefulness that people like about that and so is that exotic? It certainly isn't exotic the way it was when I was a monk. My walking around in gray robes and stuff was a little weird. But I don't find anyone now who would find me, at this point in my life, to be particularly odd or out of the mainstream. On the other end, the understanding that most people have of Buddhism is completely off base, that is a whole other issue.

For me, it's an opportunity to build a connection with other people in the Dharma, which is very, very important. Anyone who's a disciple of Shifu is our Dharma brother or Dharma sister, and it's very important that we all pass through many lives together doing this and working on these things. So I'm happy to share what I can. I trust that anything stupid I said, you'll ignore. But more importantly, is that we all are from different generations at the moment, yet we're all united in a deep faith in the Dharma and in Shifu's manifestation. I think the fact that you're all putting your lives into keeping Dharma alive in the world and finding ways to propagate, is really wonderful—that makes me really happy. ❀

問：您認為佛教已經成為西方的主流嗎？或者，美國人仍然認為佛法是種異國風情？

答：我認為它被廣泛接受，並不是說有很多信眾跟隨，而是它被認定為我們文化多元的一部分。大多數人想到佛教時，想到的是南亞地區泰國、緬甸或是西藏，但也不會有人對於我是佛教徒或者我的房子裡有5000尊佛像而感到驚訝。

很多人都有佛像。事實上，佛像在人們的家中很常見，隨處都能看到。人們崇尚一種寧靜的感覺，所以它是異國風情嗎？它當然不是我做比丘時的那種異國風味，當時的人們看我著灰色長袍走來走去是有點奇怪的。但我現在找不到任何人會注意我，在我現階段的生活裡，也不會有人認為佛教特別奇怪或脫離主流。另一方面，大多數人對佛教的理解是完全偏離了教義，那是另一個整體問題了。

對我來說，這是一個以佛法和他人建立聯繫的機會，這點非常非常重要。任何一個師父的弟子都是我們的師兄弟或師姐妹，我們多生以來一起投入這些佛事、一起修行，這是非常重要的。因此，我很樂意分享我所能分享的內容。我相信我說的任何蠢話，你們都會忽略。但更重要的是，此刻我們都來自不同的世代，我們深信佛法，也深信師父的示現，這使我們團結在一起。我認為，各位矢志讓佛法久住，並尋找弘法的方法，這真的很好——這讓我很開心。 ❀

